



## IDDSI Framework Evidence Statement

The IDDSI Framework and Descriptors are licensed under the  
[Creative Commons Attribution-Sharealike 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

October 10, 2016

## INTRODUCTION

The International Dysphagia Diet Standardisation Initiative (IDDSI) was founded in 2013 with the goal of developing new global standardised terminology and definitions to describe texture modified foods and thickened liquids used for individuals with dysphagia of all ages, in all care settings, and all cultures.

Three years of ongoing work by the International Dysphagia Diet Standardisation Committee has culminated in a final dysphagia diet framework consisting of a continuum of 8 levels (0-7). Levels are identified by numbers, text labels and colour codes.

This document provides details regarding Levels of Evidence that support the IDDSI Framework.

This document is to be read in conjunction with the Complete IDDSI Framework, IDDSI Testing Methods and IDDSI Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs) documents(<http://iddsi.org/resources/framework/>).

The IDDSI Committee would like to acknowledge the interest and participation of the global community including patients, caregivers, health professionals, industry, professional associations and researchers. We would also like to thank our sponsors for their generous support.

### **The IDDSI Committee:**

Co-Chairs: Peter Lam (CAN) & Julie Cichero (AUS);

Committee Members: Jianshe Chen (CHN), Roberto Dantas (BRA), Janice Duivestain (CAN), Ben Hanson (UK), Jun Kayashita (JPN), Caroline Lecko (UK), Mershen Pillay (ZAF), Luis Riquelme (USA), Soenke Stanschus (GER), Catriona Steele (CAN).

Past Committee Members: Joe Murray (USA)

The International Dysphagia Diet Standardisation Initiative Inc. (IDDSI) is an independent, not-for-profit entity. IDDSI is grateful to a large number of agencies, organizations and industry partners for financial and other support. Sponsors have not been involved with the design or development of the IDDSI framework.

### Development of the IDDSI framework (2012-2015)

IDDSI would like to thank and acknowledge the following sponsors for their generous support in the development of the IDDSI framework:

- Nestlé Nutrition Institute (2012-2015)
- Nutricia Advanced Medical Nutrition (2013-2014)
- Hormel Thick & Easy (2014-2015)
- Campbell's Food Service (2013-2015)
- apetito (2013-2015)
- Trisco (2013-2015)
- Food Care Co. Ltd. Japan (2015)
- Flavour Creations (2013-2015)
- Simply Thick (2015)
- Lyons (2015)

Implementation of the IDDSI framework is in progress. IDDSI is extremely grateful to all sponsors supporting implementation <http://iddsi.org/about-us/sponsors/>

# Evidence to support the IDDSI Framework

A systematic review of the literature was conducted to examine the impact of drink thickness and food texture on swallowing behaviour across the age spectrum. The systematic review was peer-reviewed and published Open Access in the Dysphagia Journal (Steele et al., 2015 Dysphagia, 30(1): 2-26; doi: [10.1007/s00455-014-9578-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00455-014-9578-x)).

## Liquids

With regards to liquids, the results of the systematic review determined:

- Thicker liquids reduce the risk of penetration–aspiration, but also increase the risk of post-swallow residue in the pharynx
- The literature was insufficient to support the delineation of specific viscosity boundaries or other quantifiable material properties related to these clinical outcomes

Of the 36 studies that met the eligibility criteria for the systematic review, 26 related to function in healthy populations whilst only 10 were related to individuals with dysphagia. Of these 10 studies, one related to infants and the remainder investigated swallowing function in adults with neurological or neurogenic conditions, or dysphagia associated with treatment for oropharyngeal or nasopharyngeal cancer.

The results of IDDSI's international stakeholder surveys demonstrated common use of thin drinks plus three levels of increasing drink thickness for the management of swallowing problems across the age spectrum. The systematic review also found research investigating the impact of thickened drinks according to this general framework (i.e., thin drinks plus three levels of increasing thickness) and described using labels previously found in previous national terminologies such as Nectar/Syrup/Level 150/Mildly thick; Honey/Custard/Level 400/Moderately thick and Pudding/Spoon thick/ Level 900/Extremely thick (Steele et al., 2015, Dysphagia, 30(1): 2-26). In addition, paediatric stakeholders reported common use of a drink thicker than water but thinner than the commencement point of thickened liquids commonly used for adults. This level has been incorporated into the IDDSI Framework as Level 1 – Slightly Thick. Level 1 – Slightly thick drinks has also been verified as distinct from other thickness levels in the literature, however, as with all other thickened liquids, this level lacks data to determine the exact thickness required for therapeutic benefit.

Given the paucity of research regarding therapeutic thickness levels for thickened drinks, the IDDSI framework is based on an understanding that increasing thickness has a demonstrated therapeutic benefit for reducing the risk of penetration/aspiration. The number of levels of drink thickness included in the framework and recommended for best practice is based on clinical experience, stakeholder consensus and expert opinion.

**The systematic review points to an urgent need to conduct quality research to determine thickness levels that provide therapeutic benefit by reducing risk for penetration/aspiration and/or improving swallowing function.**

# Foods

With regards to foods, the results of the systematic review determined:

- The best available evidence regarding the selection of an optimal food consistency for a person with dysphagia comes from the careful exploration of tolerance for different foods in a comprehensive clinical swallowing assessment;
  - Thicker and harder items require greater effort in oral processing and swallowing
- Note, terms related to choking, airway obstruction or asphyxiation were *not* included in the search strategy for this review

Of the 36 studies that met the eligibility criteria for the systematic review, 18 studies related specifically to food with one article covering both healthy adults and children. 12 studies related to healthy adults and two related to healthy children whilst five related to adults with dysphagia. Of these five studies, two related to neurological conditions, two specifically to stroke, one study to dysphagia following head and neck surgery, and one to individuals with dysphagia of mixed aetiology.

The results of international stakeholder surveys demonstrated the common use of regular food plus four to five levels of food texture modification for the management of swallowing problems across the age spectrum. A synthesis of the literature from the systematic review demonstrates broadly that solid, hard and adhesive (sticky) foods require an increased chewing rate, longer chewing duration and greater muscle effort. Pureed food requires the shortest chewing duration, least chewing and muscle effort. During normal chewing, the tongue and jaw move in a coordinated way to avoid injury from biting the tongue during chewing. This means, however, that there is no posterior tongue-to-palate seal during the chewing and oral processing of foods. This is in contrast to the pattern expected with liquids (Hiitemae & Palmer, 1999). It is not uncommon for particles of masticated food to collect in the pharynx, usually in the vallecular space, during oral preparation. Foods that require chewing do present a choking risk. Poor dentition and neurological conditions are consistently identified as risk factors for choking (Kennedy et al., 2014). In healthy people, regardless of the initial state of the food, after oral processing and at the point of swallow initiation, the bolus is a cohesive mass.

The paucity of research into the therapeutic use of food texture modification for dysphagia management means that the recommendations in this document regarding food texture are based on an understanding that altering food texture modification has demonstrated a therapeutic benefit for reducing the risk of choking. Recommendations regarding best practice are also based on clinical experience, surveys of reported practice patterns and expert opinion regarding the number of levels of food textures reported.

**There is an urgent need to generate clear descriptions for different classes of chewable food, so that empirical evidence can be collected to demonstrate associated differences in oral processing and swallowing behavior.**

## Current and planned research

IDDSI is aware of current and planned research studies of general and clinical populations using IDDSI framework stimulus items. IDDSI looks forward to updating the Evidence as these studies are published.



Variable	Reference	Grade of Evidence
Investigations of Level 3 – Moderately thick/Liquidised in the research literature	As noted in Steele et al. (2015):  Butler et al., 2004 Chi-Fishman & Sonies, 2002 Igarashi et al., 2010 Inagaki et al., 2008 Inagaki et al., 2009a Inagaki et al., 2009b Steele & Van Lieshout, 2004 Steele & Van Lieshout, 2005 Youmans et al., 2009	III-2  IV IV IV IV IV IV IV IV III-2
Investigations of Level 4 – Extremely thick / Pureed in the research literature	As noted in Steele et al. (2015):  Barata et al., 2013 Bingjie et al., 2010 Bisch et al., 1994 Butler et al., 2004 Chen et al., 1992 Chi-Fishman & Sonies, 2002 Dos Santos et al., 2011 Gisel, 1991 Inagaki et al., 2008 Inagaki et al., 2009a Inagaki et al., 2009b Ishida et al., 2002 Kim & Han, 2005 Lin et al., 2011 Newman et al., 2016 Reimers-Neils et al., 1994 Taniwaki et al., 2013 Troche et al., 2008 Youmans et al., 2009	III-2  IV III-2 III-2 IV IV IV III-2 IV IV IV IV IV III-2 IV III IV IV IV III-2
Drinks that are too thick increase the risk of post swallow residue in the pharynx	Hind et al., (2012) Newman et al. (2016) Robbins et al., (2008)	IV III II
Investigations of Level 5 – Minced & Moist In the research literature	Nil to date	
Investigations of Level 6 - Soft In the research literature	As noted in Steele et al. (2015):  Anderson et al., 2002 Ashida et al., 2007 Funami et al., 2012 Ishida et al., 2002 Lee et al., 2012 Nagatomi et al., 2008 Taniwaki et al., 2013	III-2  IV IV IV IV IV IV IV
Investigations of Level 7 - Regular In the research literature	As noted in Steele et al. (2015):  Anderson et al., 2002 Ashida et al., 2007	III-2  IV IV

Variable	Reference	Grade of Evidence
Investigation of Level 7 – Regular In the research literature contd.	Barata et al., 2013 Binjie et al., 2010 Chen et al., 1992 Hoebler et al., 1998 Ishida et al., 2002 Karkazis, 2002 Karkakazis & Kossioni, 1997 Karkakazis & Kossioni, 1998 Nagatomi et al., 2008 Ruark et al., 2002 Saitoh et al., 2007	IV III-2 IV IV IV IV IV IV IV III-2 IV
Investigations of Mixed consistency foods In the research literature	As noted in Steele et al. (2015):  Kim & Han, 2005 Lee et al., 2012 Saitoh et al., 2007	III-2  IV IV IV
Investigations of Transitional Foods In the research literature	As noted in Steele et al., (2015):  Gisel, 1991	III-2  III-2
	Dovey et al., 2013	IV
Investigations of foods that are a choking risk In the research literature	Berzlanovich et al., 1999 Chapin et al., 2013 Centre for Disease Control and Prevention, 2002 Japanese Food Commission, 2010 Kennedy et al., 2014 Morely et al., 2004 Mu et al., 1991 Rimmell et al., 1995 Seidel et al., 2002 Siddell et al., 2013 Wick et al., 2006	III-2 III-2 III-2 III-3 III-3 III-2 III-2 III-2 III-2 IV III-2 III-3
Investigations of food particle size and bite size In the research literature	Peyron et al., 2004 Woda et al., 2010 Archambault et al., 2010 Fotijn-Tekamp et al. 2004 Jalabert-Malbos et al., 2007	IV IV IV IV IV

## Grading of evidence – National Health and Medical Research Council (2009)

I <sup>a</sup>	Evidence from systematic review of level II studies
II	Evidence from a randomized control trial
III-1	Evidence from well-designed pseudo-randomised controlled trials (e.g., alternate allocation or some other method)
III-2	Evidence from comparative studies with concurrent controls and allocation not randomised experimental trial; cohort studies, case-control studies, or interrupted time-series with a control group (i.e. non-consecutive cohort study)
III-3	Evidence from comparative studies without concurrent controls, historical control study, two or more single-arm studies, or interrupted time series without a parallel control group
IV	Evidence from case series, either post-test or pre-test and post-test, or superseded reference standards

<sup>a</sup>“A systematic review will only be assigned a level of evidence as high as the studies it contains, excepting where those studies are of level II evidence.”

### **\*Accompanying documents (<http://iddsi.org/framework/>):**

- IDDSI Testing Methods
- IDDSI Evidence
- IDDSI Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs)



## References

- Anderson K, Throckmorton GS, Buschang PH, Hayasaki H. The effects of bolus hardness on masticatory kinematics. *J Oral Rehabil.* 2002;29:689–96.
- Archambault M, Millen K, Gisel EG. Effect of bite size on eating development in normal children 6 months to 2 years of age. *Physical & Occupational Therapy in Pediatrics.* 1990; 10:29-47.
- Ashida I, Iwamori H, Kawakami SY, Miyaoka Y, Murayama A. Analysis of physiological parameters of masseter muscle activity during chewing of agars in healthy young males. *J Texture Stud.* 2007;38:87–99.
- Barata LF, De Carvalho GB, Carrara-De Angelis E, De Faria JCM, Kowalski LP. Swallowing, speech and quality of life inpatients undergoing resection of soft palate. *Eur Arch Oto-Rhino-Laryngol.* 2013;270:305–12.
- Berzlanovich AM, Muhm M, Sim E et al. Foreign body asphyxiation—an autopsy study. *Am J Med* 1999; 107:351–5.
- Bingjie L, Tong Z, Xinting S, Jianmin X, Guijun J. Quantitative videofluoroscopic analysis of penetration–aspiration in post stroke patients. *Neurol India.* 2010;58:42–7.
- Bisch EM, Logemann JA, Rademaker AW, Kahrilas PJ, Lazarus CL. Pharyngeal effects of bolus volume, viscosity, and temperature in patients with dysphagia resulting from neurologic impairment and in normal subjects. *J Speech HearRes.* 1994;37:1041–59
- Butler SG, Postma GN, Fischer E. Effects of viscosity, taste, and bolus volume on swallowing apnea duration of normal adults. *Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg.* 2004;131:860–3.
- Centre for Disease Control and Prevention. Non-fatal choking related episodes among children, United States 2001. *Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2002; 51: 945–8.
- Chapin MM, Rochette LM, Abnnest JL, Haileyesus, Connor KA, Smith GA. Nonfatal choking on food among children 14 years or younger in the United States, 2001-2009, *Pediatrics.* 2013; 132:275-281.
- Chen MYM, Peele VN, Donati D, Ott DJ, Donofrio PD, Gelfand DW. Clinical and videofluoroscopic evaluation of swallowing in 41 patients with neurologic disease. *Gastrointest Radiol.* 1992;17:95–8.
- Chi-Fishman G, Sonies BC. Effects of systematic bolus viscosity and volume changes on hyoid movement kinematics. *Dysphagia.* 2002;17:278–87.
- Cichero JAY, Nicholson T, Dodrill PM. Barium liquid is not representative of infant formula: Characterisation of rheological and material properties. *Dysphagia.* 2011; 26(3): 264-271.
- de Almeida MB, de Almeida JA, Moreira ME, Novak FR. Adequacy of human milk viscosity to respond to infants with dysphagia: experimental study. *J Appl Oral Sci.* 2011;19(6):554–9.
- Dos Santos CM, Cassiani RA, Dantas RO. Videofluoroscopic evaluation of swallowing in Chagas' disease. *Dysphagia.* 2011;26:361–5.
- Dovey TM, Aldridge VK, Martin CL. Measuring oral sensitivity in clinical practice : A quick and reliable behavioural method. *Dysphagia.* 2013; 28:501-510.
- Fotijn-Tekamp FA, Slagter AP, Van der Bilt A, Van't Hof MA, Kalk W, Jansen JA. Swallowing threshold of mandibular implant-retained overdentures with variable portion sizes. *Clin Oral. Impl. Res.* 2004; 375-380.

Funami T, Ishihara S, Nakauma M, Kohyama K, Nishinari K. Texture design for products using food hydrocolloids. *Food Hydrocolloids*. 2012;26:412–20.

Gisel EG. Effect of food texture on the development of chewing of children between six months and two years of age. *Dev Med Child Neurol*. 1991;33:69–79.

Goldfield EC, Smith V, Buonomo C, Perez J, Larson K. Preterm infant swallowing of thin and nectar-thick liquids: changes in lingual-palatal coordination and relation to bolus transit. *Dysphagia*. 2013;28:234–44.

Hind J, Divyak E, Zielinski J, Taylor A, Hartman M, Gangnon R, Robbins J. Comparison of standardized bariums with varying rheological parameters on swallowing kinematics in males. *J Rehabil Res Dev*. 2012;49:1399–404.

Hoebler C, Karinthi A, Devaux MF, Guillon F, Gallant DJG, Bouchet B, Melegari C, Barry JL. Physical and chemical transformations of cereal food during oral digestion in human subjects. *Br J Nutr*. 1998;80:429–36.

Igarashi A, Kawasaki M, Nomura S, Sakai Y, Ueno M, Ashida I, Miyaoka Y. Sensory and motor responses of normal young adults during swallowing of foods with different properties and volumes. *Dysphagia*. 2010;25:198–206.

Inagaki D, Miyaoka Y, Ashida I, Yamada Y. Influence of food properties and body posture on durations of swallowing-related muscle activities. *J Oral Rehabil*. 2008;35:656–63.

Inagaki D, Miyaoka Y, Ashida I, Yamada Y. Activity pattern of swallowing-related muscles, food properties and body position in normal humans. *J Oral Rehabil*. 2009a;36:703–9.

Inagaki D, Miyaoka Y, Ashida I, Yamada Y. Influence of food properties and body position on swallowing-related muscle activity amplitude. *J Oral Rehabil*. 2009b;36:176–83.

Ishida R, Palmer JB, Hiiemae KM. Hyoid motion during swallowing: factors affecting forward and upward displacement. *Dysphagia*. 2002;17:262–72.

Jalabert-Malbos M-L, Mishellany-Dutour A, Woda A, Peyron M-A. Particle size distribution in the food bolus after mastication of natural foods. *Food Quality and Preference*. 2007; 18; 8-3-812.

Japanese Food Safety Commission, Risk Assessment Report: choking accidents caused by foods, 2010.

Karkazis HC. EMG activity of the masseter muscle in implant supported overdenture wearers during chewing of hard and soft food. *J Oral Rehabil*. 2002;29:986–91.

Karkazis HC, Kossioni AE. Re-examination of the surface EMG activity of the masseter muscle in young adults during chewing of two test foods. *J Oral Rehabil*. 1997;24:216–23.

Karkazis HC, Kossioni AE. Surface EMG activity of the masseter muscle in denture wearers during chewing of hard and soft food. *J Oral Rehabil*. 1998;25:8–14.

Kennedy B, Ibrahim JD, Bugeja L, Ranson D. Causes of death determined in medicolegal investigations in residents of nursing homes: A systematic review. *J Am Geriatr Soc*. 2014; 62:1513-1526.

Kim IS, Han TR. Influence of mastication and salivation on swallowing in stroke patients. *Arch Phys Med Rehabil*. 2005;86:1986–90.

Lee KL, Kim WH, Kim EJ, Lee JK. Is swallowing of all mixed consistencies dangerous for penetration–aspiration? *Am J PhysMed Rehabil*. 2012;91:187–92.

- Lee J, Sejdic E, Steele CM, Chau T. Effects of liquid stimuli on dual-axis swallowing accelerometry signals in a healthy population. *Biomed Eng Online*. 2010;9:7.
- Lin P, Hsiao T, Chang Y, Ting L, Chen W, Chen S, Wang T. Effects of functional electrical stimulation on dysphagia caused by radiation therapy in patients with nasopharyngeal carcinoma. *Support Care Cancer*. 2011;19:91–9.
- Linden P, Tippett D, Johnston J, Siebens A, French J. Bolus position at swallow onset in normal adults: preliminary observations. *Dysphagia*. 1989;4:146–50.
- Morley RE, Ludemann JP, Moxham JP et al. Foreign body aspiration in infants and toddlers: recent trends in British Columbia *J Otolaryngol* 2004; 33: 37–41.
- Mu L, Ping H, Sun D. Inhalation of foreign bodies in Chinese children: a review of 400 cases. *Laryngoscope* 1991; 101: 657–660.
- Nagatomi H, Yoshimine M, Miura H, Tanaka Y, Arai I. Multivariate analysis of the mechanical properties of boluses during mastication with the normal dentitions. *J Med Dent Sci*. 2008, 55: 197-206.
- National Health and Medical Research Council of Australia. NHMRC levels of evidence and grades for recommendations for developers of guidelines. Canberra: National Health and Medical Research Council; 2009.
- Newman R, Vilardell N, Clave P, Speyer R. Effect of bolus viscosity on the safety and efficacy of swallowing and the kinematic response in patients with oropharyngeal dysphagia: White paper by the European Society of Swallowing Disorders (ESSD). *Dysphagia*. 2016, 31(2): 232-249.
- Oommen ER, Kim Y, McCullough G. Stage transition and laryngeal closure in poststroke patients with dysphagia. *Dysphagia*. 2011;26:318–23.
- Peyron MA, Mishellany A, Woda A. Particle size distribution of food boluses after mastication of six natural foods. *J Dent Res*. 2004; 83:578-582.
- Reimers-Neils L, Logemann J, Larson C. Viscosity effects on EMG activity in normal swallow. *Dysphagia*. 1994;9:101–6.
- Rimmell F, Thome A, Stool S et al. Characteristics of objects that cause choking in children. *JAMA* 1995; 274: 1763–6.
- Robbins J, Gensler G, Hind J, Logemann J, Lindblad AS, Brandt D. ... & Miller-Gardner PJ. Comparison of two interventions for liquid aspiration on pneumonia incidence: a randomized trial. *Annals of Internal Medicine*, 2008; 148; 509–18.
- Ruark JL, McCullough GH, Peters RL, Moore CA. Bolus consistency and swallowing in children and adults. *Dysphagia*. 2002;17:24–33.
- Saitoh E, Shibata S, Matsuo K, Baba M, Fujii W, Palmer JB. Chewing and food consistency: effects on bolus transport and swallow initiation. *Dysphagia*. 2007;22:100–7.
- Seidel JS, Gausche-Hill M. Lychee-flavoured gel candies. A potentially lethal snack for infants and children. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med* 2002; 156: 1120–22.

September C, Nicholson TM, Cichero JAY. Implications of changing the amount of thickener in thickened infant formula for infants with dysphagia. *Dysphagia*. 2014; 29(4): 432-437.

Siddel DR, Kim IA, Coker TR, Moreno C, Shapiro NL. Food choking hazards in children. *Int J Ped Otorhinolaryngol*, 2013. 77: 1940-1946.

Steele, C, Alsanei, Ayanikalath et al. The influence of food texture and liquid consistency modification on swallowing physiology and function: A systematic review. *Dysphagia*. 2015; 30: 2-26.

Steele CM, Van Lieshout PH. Influence of bolus consistency on lingual behaviours in sequential swallowing. *Dysphagia*. 2004;19: 192–206.

Steele CM, van Lieshout PH. Does barium influence tongue behaviours during swallowing? *Am J Speech Lang Pathol*. 2005;14: 27–39.

Stuart S, Motz JM. Viscosity in infant dysphagia management: comparison of viscosity of thickened liquids used in assessment and thickened liquids used in treatment. *Dysphagia*. 2009;24(4):412–22.

Taniwaki M, Gao Z, Nishinari K, Kohyama K. Acoustic analysis of the swallowing sounds of food with different physical properties using the cervical auscultation method. *J Texture Stud*. 2013;44:169–75.

Troche MS, Sapienza CM, Rosenbek JC. Effects of bolus consistency on timing and safety of swallow in patients with Parkinson's disease. *Dysphagia*. 2008;23:26–32.

Wick R, Gilbert JD, Byard RW. Café coronary syndrome – fatal choking on food: an autopsy approach. *J Clin. Forensic Med*. 2006; 13:135-138.

Woda A, Nicolas E, Mishellany-Dutour A, Hannequin M, Mazille M-N, Veyrone J-L, Peyron M-A. The masticatory normative indicator. *J Dent Res*. 2010; 89:281-285.

Youmans SR, Youmans GL, Stierwalt JA. Differences in tongue strength across age and gender: is there a diminished strength reserve? *Dysphagia*. 2009;24:57–65.